Forth Standards Committee #3

Doubletree Hilton, Queensferry Crossing, Scotland

12–14 September 2018

Draft Minutes

1 Participants

PB	Paul Bennett	HIDEC Consultancy	England	
WB	Willem Botha	CCS	South Africa	
JD	Jermain Davies	CCS	South Africa	
AH	Andrew Haley	Red Hat, Cambridge	England	
UH	Ulrich Hoffmann	FH Wedel	Germany	
PK	Peter Knaggs	Independent, Trowbridge	England	(Editor)
BP	Bernd Paysan	Net2o	Germany	(Treasurer)
SP	Stephen Pelc	MPE	England	(Chair)
LW	Leon Wagner	FORTH, Inc.	USA	
GW	Gerald Wodni	Independent, Wien	Austria	(Technical)

- Sergey Baranov and Anton Ertl will be deemed to have resigned from the committee should they fail to attend the next meeting.

- Jermain Davies has become a full member of the committee.

- Paul Bennett became a full members of the committee at the last meeting, but was not minuted.

2 Review of procedures

1. Committee membership rules to be reviewed to allow for Proxy attendance.   (8/0/0)
   Action: PK/LW

2. Minutes of all meetings should be made available on `www.forth-standard.org`.   (8/0/0)
   Action: PK/GW

3. Call for Votes to be conducted on `www.forth-standard.org`. (8/0/0)   **Action: PK/GW**

4. Allow for proposals that are not related to exiting item. (8/0/0)   **Action: GW**

5. Move proposal archive on `www.forth200x.org` to `www.forth-standard.org` with signposting on `www.forth200x.org`. (8/0/0)   **Action: AE/GW**

6. Add approved flag to libraries on `theForth.net` to be set by vote of the committee.
   (8/0/0)   **Action: GW**

7. Add "Experimental Proposal" section to `www.forth-standard.org` where the committee can mark proposal for further experimentation and feedback. (8/0/0)   **Action: GW**

3 Reports

3.1 Chair

No report given.

3.2 Editor

1. Results of the last meeting have been published on `www.forth200x.org`.
   Changes accepted with spelling changes   (8/0/0)

2. The Quotations proposal did not actually propose any changes to the document. The editor has attempted to integrate the proposal into the document, but is unhappy with the result and would like feedback on this change. **Action: AE/PK**

3. GitHub project exists, but has not been populated. Assistance requested in moving CVS archive on `www.forth200x.org` to `github.com/PeterKnaggs/forth-standard` would be appreciated. **Action: BP/GW/AE**

3.3 Technical

1. `www.forth-standard.org` is up and running but proposals are not being submitted.

2. Assistance is sought to improve the proposal section of the site. **Action: GW**

3. Integrate the exiting Forth200x Committee web site (`forth200x.wodni.at`) into `www.forth-standard.org` **Action: GW**

4. We should consider using video conferencing for electronic meetings.

3.4 Treasurer

Current balance: 0, no income, no outgoings, no bank account.

4 Review of proposals and activities

Proposal	Comments	Vote	**Action**
CS-DROP	Allowing `CS-DROP` to drop an *orig* was discussed, this would require allowing `CS-PICK` to pick an *orig*. Referred to author for further consideration	9/0/0	**UH**
Recognisers	Accepted as an experimental proposal.	8/0/0	**GW**
Internationalisation	Accepted as an experimental proposal.	9/0/0	**GW**
S(	Discussion moved to 6.8		**UH**

Synonym	It was felt that rewording of the definition of SYNONYM would overcome the issued identified in a more succinct manner. Referred to author of original Synonym proposal to review.		**SP/BP**
Clarify Find	It was felt that the revised text was just as confusing as the text it was replacing and that changing FIND will cause just as much confusion. FIND should be deprecated after FIND-NAME has been standardised. Referred back to author.	10/0/0	**??**
FIND-NAME	Accepted	9/0/1	**PK/AE**
Exception Locals	AE's response was endorsed. Referred back to author	10/0/0	**AE**
BL Rational	Referred to author to take though the proposal process	10/0/0	**AE/BP**
32-/64-bit floats	The standard does not specify the use of single or double precision floats. Referred back to author.	10/0/0	**AH**
Directories	Discussion moved to 6.4 and referred back to author.		**GW**
Multi-Tasking	Discussion moved to 6.2 and referred back to author.		**AH**
Experimental Proposals	Discussion moved to 6.6 and referred back to author.		**PK**
Forth200x.org	See 3.3.		**GW**
Test suite	A version has already been integrated into the document. Adopting updates will require additional changes on an ongoing bases. If was felt that endorsing the library would be a better approach.	8/0/0	**GW**
External function integration	Discussion moved to 6.5		**SP**

5 Consideration of proposals (CfVs)

See the review of proposals and activities (section 4).

6 Workshops

6.1 Recognisers

Version 4 of the recognisers proposal was accepted as an "experimental proposal".

6.2 Multitasking

Attending: AH/PB/JD/WB/LW/SP/GW/PK

The Multi-tasking proposal was presented and discussed, with feedback sought by the author before bringing the proposal to the committee. **Action: AH**

6.3 NDCS Compilation

Attending: AH/PB/JD/WB/LW/GW/SP/PK/UH/BP

After some discussion, is was suggested the name NDCS (None Default Compilation Semantics) be changed to Dual (Dule Behaviour). The author was encouraged to bring this forward as an experimental proposal. **Action: SP**

6.4 Directories

Attending: AH/JD/WB/LW/GW/SP/PK/UH/BP

The directories proposal was presented and discussed, with feedback sought by the author before brining the proposal to the committee. **Action: GW**

6.5 External function integration

Attending: LW/AH/SP/GW/BP

The idea of using the MPE notation for integrating C functions into Forth was discussed. It was suggested that with minor changes this may be acceptable as a standard notation. **Action: SP/BP**

6.6 Experimental proposals

Attending: AH/LW/GW/PK

The "Proposal Process" in the front-matter of the document was rewritten to describe the new `www.forth-standard.org` based process of publishing proposals. A proposal will be raised to replace the exiting text. **Action: GW/PK**

6.7 Ambiguous Conditions

Attending: AH/PB/JD/WB/LW/GW/PK/UH/BP

The first 16 ambiguous conditions in section 4.1.2 where discussed.

- a name is neither a valid definition name nor a valid number during text interpretation;

  Section 9.3.4 indicates the system should throw a -13 (undefined word) exception, thus this is no longer an ambiguous condition.

- a definition name exceeded the maximum length allowed;

  Add the following to the end of the first paragraph of 3.3.1.2 (Definition names):

  > Defining a name longer than the implementation defined limit will throw a -19 (definition name too long) exception.

  Thus removing this ambiguous condition.

- argument type incompatible with specified input parameter, e.g., passing a *flag* to a word expecting an n (3.1 Data types);

  The example is confusing and should be removed.

- insufficient space in the dictionary;

  Section 9.3.4 indicate the system should throw a -8 (dictionary overflow) exception, thus this is no longer an ambiguous condition.

These changes where accepted and will be integrated into the next revision of the document. (9/0/0) **Action: PK**

6.8 Reservation of names

Weather or not to provide a method of reserving names within the document.
This workshop was not held due to lack of time.

7 Matters Arising

None.

8 Any Other Business

None.

9 Date of Next Meeting

A video conference to be held some time in the next years, exact date to be notified by the Chair. The time of the meeting was set at 15:00 UTC.

The next standards meeting will be held immediately before the next euroForth conference being held in Germany.